

Proposal for Engineering and Surveying Services

	<u>AES Northeast</u>	<u>Clough Harbour & Associates LLP</u>	<u>Fred Keil & Associates</u>	<u>Infinigy Engineering</u>	<u>Tectonic</u>	<u>The Chazen Companies</u>
Mandatory - APA experience	X	X		X	X	X
<u>I. Qualifications of Staff (30 points)</u>						
Qualifications (specifically years of experience) - Civil Engineer	10	10	0	10	10	0
Qualifications of Surveyor and/or Geologist	10	10	10	10	10	10
Graphic Design Qualifications	10	10	10	10	10	10
<u>II. Experience (20 points)</u>						
Projects similar in scope (i.e. towers)	19	20	0	20	20	20
<u>III. Quality of deliverable (20)</u>	20	20	?	20	20	?
<u>IV. Experience working with Essex County Radio Project and/or consultants (10)</u>	0	0	0	10	0	0
<u>V. Cost</u>	20	19	11	20	20	14
Total	89	89	31	100	90	54

April 1, 2010

Evaluation of APA analysis for Radio Sites

Proposals were received from the following:

AES Northeast
Fred Keil & Associates
Infinigy Engineering
The Chazen Companies
Cough Harbour & Associates
Tectonic

All of the Engineering/Surveying firms that we received proposals from were highly qualified and with the exception of Fred Keil & Associates, have had experience working with the A.P.A. Also, every firm, again, with the exception of Fred Keil, has a Civil Engineer who has experience with the APA and a graphic designer or qualified Information Technology personnel.

Although, most all of the firms were qualified, there was a great disparity in the proposal cost. The prices ranged from \$18,000 to \$73,254.

Evaluation Criteria

Proposals were evaluated using three sets of criteria. Firms meeting the mandatory criteria will have their proposals evaluated and scored for both technical qualifications and price. The following represented the principal selection criteria that were considered during the evaluation process.

1. Mandatory Elements
 - a. All of the firms are licensed in NYS.
 - b. All of the proposers have adequate experience on similar assignments.
 - c. The firms adhered to the instructions in this request for proposal on preparing and submitting the proposal.
2. Technical Quality (Maximum Points – 80)

Expertise and Experience –

Infinigy Engineering received top rankings in all areas including the cost. Their past projects consist of eight projects that were of similar nature to the radio towers. The firm has experience working with the County's consultant, Jacqueline Murray of the Murray Law Firm, who is the attorney that is currently working on the radio project. We contacted her for a recommendation and it was excellent. Their proposal is \$18,900.

Tectonic ranked second mainly because they don't have the experience working with Essex County and secondly because their proposal for the project is \$38,354 which is double the cost of Infinigy Engineering.

A.E.S. Northeast ranked third. Although, very qualified, most of the projects that were completed were building projects not towers. There were only two projects that were of a similar nature. Their proposal is \$18,267.

3. Price (Maximum Points – 20)

Cost was not the primary factor in the selection of a firm. The proposed price was graded based upon the following formula:

Average Bid/Your Bid = X (whereby X can not exceed 100%)

$X * 20 \text{ points} = \text{Points awarded based on cost}$

Three of the firms, Infinigy, Tectonic, and AES Northeast received the maximum 20 points. See the attached spread sheet for the computation.

Based on my evaluation and in collaboration with Don Jaquish, Director of Emergency Services, and Michael Blaise, Deputy Director of Emergency Services I am awarding to Infinigy.

Linda Wolf,
Purchasing Agent